

**To:** Chambers, Laura (Rockefeller)[Laura\_Chambers@rockefeller.senate.gov]  
**Cc:** Ferrell, Mark[Ferrell.Mark@epa.gov]; Miller, Linda[miller.linda@epa.gov]  
**From:** Levine, Carolyn  
**Sent:** Tue 2/18/2014 5:24:42 PM  
**Subject:** RE: update on samples

Hi Laura,

Copied below are EPA responses to your questions from Friday. I hope this is helpful. Please let us know if you have any questions.

**Q1. Have you received the summary from American Water regarding residuals in piping? Has EPA done an independent work on this?**

EPA received a draft summary document today (February 18, 2014) and will conduct an internal review.

**Q2. Could you please provide a brief update on clean-up efforts?**

EPA's On-Scene Coordinator has heard that WVDEP and the Attorney General Office, along with the Chemical Safety Board, have indicated that they would allow Freedom Industries to begin demolition plans to remove tanks 393 and 394, which are located at the far northern end of the facility. We understand that the facility is scheduled to meet with the Charleston Sanitation Board on Wednesday, February 19, 2014, to discuss disposal of the stored water via POTW.

The site is stabilized and work continues to control the source of the contamination at the site. This work was started with the emptying of the leaked tank and its two companion tanks. The remaining 14 tanks are being systematically emptied. The collection trenches, sumps and collection piping are collecting the water and remaining chemical that was under the leaked tank.

The snow and rain have generated considerable amounts of water through the facility, both surface and subsurface water. The facility has also placed boom in the river adjacent to the facility to contain water and possible chemical from traveling downstream. The collection of water will continue until the tanks and underlying concrete pad can be removed and the subsurface excavated. This area is being preserved for now to preserve the evidence for the investigation by CSB and the FBI. EPA, WVDEP and the facility have sampled the water collected from several points on the site, which are being analyzed. The collection mechanisms have been effective in containing the water that continues to seep from the site. The facility has hired a contractor to develop a long term remediation plan to find and remove any residual contamination.

**Q3. Has sampling for PPH below 2 PPM been completed? What levels is the chemical being tested at?**

EPA is not currently testing water samples for PPH. Results reported for PPH and DiPPH on the WV Homeland Security site show all the intake and treated water samples are non-detect - their lab's detection limit is 10 ppb:

[http://www.dhsem.wv.gov/Documents/Master%20PPH%20LOG\\_PUBLIC%2012%20FEB%2014%201430.pdf](http://www.dhsem.wv.gov/Documents/Master%20PPH%20LOG_PUBLIC%2012%20FEB%2014%201430.pdf)

**Q4. Any more information on why formaldehyde could have been more common the toilet tanks or Mr. Simonton's testing methods?**

EPA is aware that formaldehyde was detected at very low concentrations in three toilet tanks in a single restaurant, so there is not much basis for comparison with other locations. Formaldehyde is found in many commercial products. The concentrations reported by Dr. Simonton (32 and 33 parts per billion) are much lower than EPA's life-time health advisory for formaldehyde in drinking water, which is 1,000 parts per billion (or one part per million).

-----  
*Carolyn Levine*  
*Office of Congressional and Intergovernmental Relations*  
*U.S. EPA*  
*(202) 564-1859*  
*levine.carolyn@epa.gov*

**From:** Chambers, Laura (Rockefeller) [mailto:Laura\_Chambers@rockefeller.senate.gov]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, February 18, 2014 10:11 AM  
**To:** Ferrell, Mark  
**Cc:** Levine, Carolyn  
**Subject:** RE: update on samples

Hi Mark and Carolyn,

Hope you enjoyed the long weekend. Please let me know if you are able to follow-up on any of our questions today.

Many thanks,  
Laura

**From:** Ferrell, Mark [mailto:Ferrell.Mark@epa.gov]  
**Sent:** Friday, February 14, 2014 1:46 PM  
**To:** Chambers, Laura (Rockefeller)  
**Cc:** Levine, Carolyn  
**Subject:** Re: update on samples

Laura, our Philly office was closed yesterday and DC is, well, you know. So were a little behind at the moment on some of our coordination efforts, particularly with other agencies similarly affected, but let me see what we can get for you that we have as of today.

Mark

**From:** Chambers, Laura (Rockefeller) <Laura\_Chambers@rockefeller.senate.gov>  
**Sent:** Friday, February 14, 2014 1:24:51 PM  
**To:** Ferrell, Mark; Levine, Carolyn  
**Cc:** Snyder, Raquel; Miller, Linda  
**Subject:** RE: update on samples

Hi all,

I wanted to circle back around on a few things as we plan to give the Senator another update this afternoon:

- Have you received the summary from American Water regarding residuals in piping? Has EPA done an independent work on this?
- Could you please provide a brief update on clean-up efforts?
- Has sampling for PPH below 2 PPM been completed? What levels is the chemical being tested at?

- Any more information on why formaldehyde could have been more common the toilet tanks or Mr. Simonton's testing methods?

Many thanks for your help on getting us answers. Any other additional updates you have outside of these questions would be welcome too.

Laura

**From:** Ferrell, Mark [<mailto:Ferrell.Mark@epa.gov>]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, February 11, 2014 1:53 PM  
**To:** Chambers, Laura (Rockefeller); Levine, Carolyn  
**Cc:** Snyder, Raquel; Miller, Linda  
**Subject:** Re: update on samples

Regarding the question on residuals in pipe. American Water is providing a summary of the exiting science addressing residuals in piping. We are expecting the summary by the end of the week. Once we have it, EPA will provide a review. I will keep you posted on it's progress.

**From:** Chambers, Laura (Rockefeller) <[Laura\\_Chambers@rockefeller.senate.gov](mailto:Laura_Chambers@rockefeller.senate.gov)>  
**Sent:** Monday, February 10, 2014 4:56:39 PM  
**To:** Levine, Carolyn  
**Cc:** Snyder, Raquel; Miller, Linda; Ferrell, Mark  
**Subject:** RE: update on samples

Thanks for the update on the response to the health study. Appreciate and info others can give on the additional questions relating to reactions to pipes, the formaldehyde found at Vandalia Grille and updates on remediation efforts.

Laura

**From:** Levine, Carolyn [<mailto:Levine.Carolyn@epa.gov>]  
**Sent:** Monday, February 10, 2014 4:47 PM  
**To:** Chambers, Laura (Rockefeller)  
**Cc:** Snyder, Raquel; Miller, Linda; Ferrell, Mark  
**Subject:** RE: update on samples

Hi Laura,

I am adding Linda Miller and Mark Ferrell in our Region 3 office who have been working with the technical folks to respond to your questions. They can facilitate responding to your additional questions.

Regarding the Senator's letter to CDC and EPA, we have prepared a joint response with CDC which should be coming from CDC in the next day or so.

Please let us know if you have additional questions.

-----  
Carolyn Levine  
Office of Congressional and Intergovernmental Relations  
U.S. EPA  
(202) 564-1859  
[levine.carolyn@epa.gov](mailto:levine.carolyn@epa.gov)

-----Original Message-----

From: Chambers, Laura (Rockefeller) [[mailto:Laura\\_Chambers@rockefeller.senate.gov](mailto:Laura_Chambers@rockefeller.senate.gov)]  
Sent: Monday, February 10, 2014 3:17 PM  
To: Levine, Carolyn  
Cc: Snyder, Raquel  
Subject: RE: update on samples

Hi Carolyn,

I hope you had a good weekend. I wanted to follow-up on my last email on Friday afternoon and also I had some more follow-up questions we are trying to stay on top of.

- o Is there any additional info on MCHM or PPh and how it behaves with different types of pipes. Our initial questions were: Do they cling to materials like glass or metal? Do they permeate plastic/PVC? (there have been some conflicting reports on how chemicals would react to metal, glass, plastic, PVC, clay etc)
- o Any updates on remediation? (especially in light of recent weather - freeze / thaw, higher river levels)
- o Any progress on a response from EPA and CDC on the Senator's request for a long-term study?

Thanks for your help in getting us answers.

All the best,

Laura

-----Original Message-----

From: Chambers, Laura (Rockefeller)  
Sent: Friday, February 07, 2014 6:02 PM  
To: 'Levine, Carolyn'  
Subject: RE: update on samples

Thanks for sharing. Did you mean 190 PPB?

Is formaldehyde very common in toilets or at least more common than in faucet water? If so, why? Is there a reason it would be more common in toilet water than faucet water- IE from cleaning products?

Thanks,  
Laura

-----Original Message-----

From: Levine, Carolyn [<mailto:Levine.Carolyn@epa.gov>]

Sent: Friday, February 07, 2014 5:28 PM  
To: Chambers, Laura (Rockefeller)  
Cc: Miller, Linda; Ferrell, Mark  
Subject: RE: update on samples

Hi Laura,

We have some additional information regarding Dr. Simonton. EPA contacted Dr. Simonton/Marshall University to ask questions concerning the reported formaldehyde results in some water samples. On February 5th, Dr. Simonton provided EPA with a lab report for five samples collected at one location - Vandalia Grille - on 1/13/14.

The regional lab's summary of results based on the lab report:

- Five samples (3 from water tanks from bathroom toilets) collected on 1/13/14.
- Positive formaldehyde results were 32 ppb and 33 ppb and were from the 3 toilet water samples.
- Only two of the samples with positive formaldehyde results had positive detects for MCHM (160 ppb and 1900 ppb). One sample with 32ppb of formaldehyde was non-detect for MCHM at a detection limit of 50 ppb.
- Method blanks were non-detect for formaldehyde and MCHM.

EPA will be following up with Dr. Simonton to obtain more specifics on the raw data and discuss details of methodology.

-----  
Carolyn Levine  
Office of Congressional Affairs  
U.S. EPA  
(202) 564-1859  
[levine.carolyn@epa.gov](mailto:levine.carolyn@epa.gov)

---

From: Levine, Carolyn  
Sent: Friday, February 07, 2014 11:16 AM  
To: Chambers, Laura (Rockefeller)  
Subject: RE: update on samples

Hi Laura,

Our regional office did finally make contact with the scientist and received some data and information. I will find out more details and I will let you know.

-----  
Carolyn Levine  
Office of Congressional Affairs  
U.S. EPA  
(202) 564-1859  
[levine.carolyn@epa.gov](mailto:levine.carolyn@epa.gov)

---

From: Chambers, Laura (Rockefeller) [Laura\_Chambers@rockefeller.senate.gov]  
Sent: Friday, February 07, 2014 10:37 AM  
To: Levine, Carolyn  
Subject: RE: update on samples

Hi Carolyn,

Has anyone been able to get in touch with the Marshall scientist yet?

From: Levine, Carolyn [mailto:Levine.Carolyn@epa.gov]  
Sent: Thursday, January 30, 2014 2:59 PM  
To: Chambers, Laura (Rockefeller)  
Subject: RE: update on samples

Surface water sampling includes-  
Drainage on site-there are trenches upgradient and downgradient of site, sampling is in the surface water runoff into trench.

-----  
Carolyn Levine  
Office of Congressional and Intergovernmental Relations U.S. EPA  
(202) 564-1859  
[levine.carolyn@epa.gov](mailto:levine.carolyn@epa.gov)<<mailto:levine.carolyn@epa.gov>>

From: Chambers, Laura (Rockefeller) [mailto:Laura\_Chambers@rockefeller.senate.gov]  
Sent: Thursday, January 30, 2014 2:45 PM  
To: Levine, Carolyn  
Subject: RE: update on samples

Are these samples coming directly from the tank or groundwater surrounding?

From: Levine, Carolyn [mailto:Levine.Carolyn@epa.gov]  
Sent: Thursday, January 30, 2014 2:40 PM  
To: Chambers, Laura (Rockefeller)  
Cc: Miller, Linda  
Subject: update on samples

Hi Laura,

Some additional info. from EPA R3-

The facility's remediation consultant, CEC, collected two surface water samples on January 29, 2014. EPA, WVDEP, and plaintiff representatives collected split samples. EPA's split samples were shipped to the Region 3 Lab for Trace VOC and MCHM/PPH analysis. CEC plans on re-developing monitor wells onsite to facilitate collection of groundwater samples, which should occur on Monday, February 3, 2014.

-----

Carolyn Levine  
Office of Congressional and Intergovernmental Relations U.S. EPA  
(202) 564-1859  
[levine.carolyn@epa.gov](mailto:levine.carolyn@epa.gov)<mailto:levine.carolyn@epa.gov>

**Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy**